

CHATHAM AREA TRANSIT
AUTHORITY

BOARD MEETING

OF

May 14, 2010

11:21 A.M.

CHAIRMAN LIAKAKIS: Okay I like to call the meeting to order now for the Chatham Area Transit Authority and call on Patricia for the roll call.

MRS. CLARK: Good morning. Mr. Liakakis

CHAIRMAN LIAKAKIS: Here

MRS. CLARK: Dr. Thomas

MRS. CLARK: Ms. Stone

MS. STONE: Present

MRS. CLARK: Mr. Holmes

MR. HOLMES: Here

MRS. CLARK: Mr. Shay

CHAIRMAN LIAKAKIS: He's here he just went out. He'll be here in a moment.

MRS. CLARK: Mr. Farrell

MR. FARRELL: Here

MRS. CLARK: Mr. Odell

MR. ODELL: Here

MRS. CLARK: Mr. Gellatly

MRS. CLARK: Mr. Kicklighter

MR. KICKLIGHTER: here

MRS. CLARK: Mr. Broker

MRS. CLARK: Mr. Dawson

MR. DAWSON: Here

MRS. CLARK: And Mr. Oakley.

MR. OAKLEY: Here

Also present at the meeting was Leamon R. Holliday, III, Charles I. Odimgbe, and Patricia Clark.

MR. KICKLIGHTER: At this point I'd like to make a motion to excuse Dr. Thomas and Commissioner Gellatly from the meeting.

MS. STONE: Second.

CHAIRMAN LIAKAKIS: Okay all in favor signify by raising your hand. Motion passes. Next item, approval of the minutes from the last meeting that was distributed to all the members of the CAT Board we need a motion on the floor to approve.

MR. DAWSON: Second.

CHAIRMAN LIAKAKIS: I have a motion on the floor and a second to approve the minutes of the last meeting. All in favor signify by raising your hand. Motion passes. New business, under one; certificate of recognition to Mrs. Leslie Nissen from Helen Stone.

MR. ODIMGBE: Chairman if I may, we had scheduled for Mrs. Nissen to be here today. She got in touch with us, due to medical reasons she was unable to and I'm asking if the Board could indulge us and reschedule because I think what she's doing for the community is really good and I'd like the Board to be able to acknowledge her and give her this presentation in person.

CHAIRMAN LIAKAKIS: Put it on the agenda for another time.

MS. STONE: I would concur with that. I would really like for her to be present.

CHAIRMAN LIAKAKIS: Sure.

MS. STONE: Thank you.

CHAIRMAN LIAKAKIS: Okay item two; request Board approval for fare free day on June 17, 2010 in collaboration with the American Public Transportation Association's nationally supported Dump the Pump event. Charles.

MR. ODIMGBE: Thank you Mr. Chairman. Every year we come to the Board and ask the Board to support the initiative that is carried out by APTA. And this year we are asking that the Board in support of this

Dump the Pump event to declare June 17th a fare free day for the County. Because we know that using transportation and other modes of transportation outside of our vehicles does save us money and will help us in our quest to become the greenest county in Georgia. What we are asking the Board to do today is that the Board approve the participation in the Dump the Pump event by Chatham Area Transit.

MR. KICKLIGHTER: Question. Statically, do we have any stats out there available that would show that the loss of monies for a day like this would be made up by increase in ridership? In other words in my thoughts in looking through this earlier is a lot – okay a lot of people that ride mass transportation they do so because they don't have vehicles. A lot of people are saving gas and they figured out it is financially better but who will it entice that's not utilizing it or does not already utilize –is that gonna entice a lot of people that's not riders and actually weigh out better? I say this because I know the roll back and the millage rate all the years were operating on a tiny little budget really and can we afford to lose that day and how much would that be?

MR. ODIMGBE: Well typically and CAT is not an exception to this rule, we have two category of riders; the dependent riders or the choice riders. I think this initiative is designed to entice the choice riders who may want to try it on that day because it's free. Your first question about statistics I do not have any data as it relates to Chatham Area Transit that will support that we make that money later on however, the initiative is strictly designed to give more information to the public about the values of public transportation. And one of the return on investment that we are hoping with time we will get more choice riders to start to try transit.

MR. KICKLIGHTER: I just think that using the monies that we would lose from a day like that would be better utilized to promote and publicize CAT rather than just free fares. Because on that area that we're trying to hit with that choice riders if you're choosing to ride CAT, then you can afford to pay the dollar or you know, the fee. And I just don't think that little charge for the choice rider is a deterrent and I just think we'd be better off using the money to advertising.

CHAIRMAN LIAKAKIS: I'm gonna call on you. Harris Odell please.

MR. ODELL: I don't think that it should be justified based upon a clear cash return. We do this for one day and then within x period of time we can see the collective financial benefit. There's no way to measure that. But there's some greater reasons why we should do this. Reason number one is that public relations and it's a national effort. Reason number two is our problem as far as transportation will never pave our

way out of our current problem. So it's in our greater good to try to encourage people to utilize public transportation. I resent the implication that –and I know it's a simple slip of the tongue by the director, choice rider. Those people who choose to ride CAT for whatever their reasons are choice riders they are. The simple fact that some people have other options, to me does not make them a better or more whatever than the people who don't so I don't particularly care for that term. Dean I don't think it can ever be justified on immediate cost benefit but if you do and look at a best value concept and a best value concept is; we gotta encourage people where possible to use public transportation. This is one little way of doing it. Two is that this is a way of our advertising. We want to be the greenest county you know, but being the greenest county would hopefully include having people dump their cars for a period of time. I think it's a good concept. The financial woes that we face with CAT has absolutely nothing to do with the fragility of our budget based upon this one day it is arguable has nothing to do with it.

CHAIRMAN LIAKAKIS: Charles one of the important things when you have something like that is you put it out in the media so they fully understand it. I read the newspaper from the first page to the last page, even looking at some of the advertisements in there. But the thing about it is we've multitudes of radio stations here. If you call up and talk to the program director who sets those up, those are called PSA (Public Service Announcements) and a lot of those have to be given to the public free because that's what the Federal Communication Commission states that the radio stations have an obligation for those PSA's. So between now and Monday if you're gonna do that and I understand what Dean's saying because we got a tight budget or whatever and of course what Harris is talking about, but between now and Monday because Monday is the day you gone do it right?

MR. ODIMGBE: No it's June 17th.

CHAIRMAN LIAKAKIS: Oh in June? Oh okay in June. Excuse me, I thought it was gonna be this Monday, but that's fine then. If you going to do that is to put out as much advertising as possible especially those PSA's and get with the newspaper, put that in there and the four TV stations that we have. Because with all of that telling the people that they can ride it for free between now and June the 17th you could pick up a lot of people possible like with Dean was saying just now to go on with that situation, but lets try that and get a couple of your employees and you might follow up with a phone call. Send a message to all of the news media okay. Television, radio, newspaper and then have follow up phone calls that go to each one of those stations and all for those PSA's. Just tell them you appreciate that so that something can occur on it. Dean.

MR. KICKLIGHTER: Based on my deep respect for my colleague here Commissioner Odell, his opinion and me being usually listening to what he just tells me, I would make a motion to approve this.

MR. ODELL: And I will second it, but I have a comment to make if I might. Dean I never argue with you when you agree with me.

MR. KICKLIGHTER: I know it, and you were ready too!

MR. ODELL: But there is a point and the point is that often in government we do things based upon that fictitious human good, but we never think of applying business application to measure the importance of the impact of that which, which you know—I'm in private business for 30 years. I don't have a tax base. I can't go to folk and tax so things have to make a business sense for me to do it. I would like; following up on what Dean said, I'd like to know the ridership the day before July the 15th –June 16th, the ridership the day of and the ridership the day after. Those numbers will tell us a couple of things potentially. It will tell us what for that period of time perhaps what our ridership is and it will also tell us if our actions are having any impact on the ridership. Do you follow what I'm saying?

MR. ODIMGBE: I understand.

MR. ODELL: So those are very crucial numbers and I'd like to see that and have that information shared with the fellow Board members if that's possible.

MR. ODIMGBE: We'll get you those numbers. In fact I think we'll take it one step further. I will make a comparison with our daily average ridership compared to that day's ridership and also compare that day's ridership to the same for same period for the year before which is typically how gage ridership. And I can tell you the last time we did it last year the ridership was dismal when compared to what happened the year before and the reason was it just rained that day; it just rained all on that day even though we collaborated with the city newspaper was very supportive. We had so many programs going the rain just put a damper on the whole plan so we are hoping this is going to be a much better day and yes we will get you those numbers.

MR. ODELL: And also get us the cost.

MR. ODIMGBE: We are looking for that day an average of about \$9,000 in lost revenues.

CHAIRMAN LIAKAKIS: Alright Charles when you send those PSA's out and you write those messages. Here's what you say in there; don't just say ride the CAT bus system for free. What you're say is reduce pollution okay, reduce traffic congestion and save yourself some monies by riding free on the Chatham Area Transit.

MR. ODIMGBE: Yes sir.

CHAIRMAN LIAKAKIS: If you do that see that, that gives a message because you're doing it in a number of ways to encourage people that they can help in 3 ways specially helping themselves by saving money by using the CAT system.

MR. KICKLIGHER: I'm feeling an advertising side business coming on.

CHAIRMAN LIAKAKIS: Okay, alright next; request the Board approve a proclamation establishing the fifth annual national Dump the Pump day in Chatham County on June 17th. We need--

MR. FARRELL: So moved.

MR. ODELL: Second.

CHAIRMAN LIAKAKIS: We have a motion on the floor and a second all in favor signify by raising your hand. Motion passes. Request Board approval for purchase of 5 hybrid buses. Charles.

MR. ODIMGBE: Thank you Mr. Chairman. We are asking the Board to approve for us to purchase 5 additional hybrid buses to date we have 9 buses that have exhausted their useful lives. They are actually hanging on threads right now. Most of these buses have more than 500,000 miles on them. 500,000 miles is the recommended FTA useful life for fixed route bus. Just as a part of our background, the Board --we just purchased last year 11 hybrid buses that we have running on the streets right now. We have 9 additional hybrid buses on order with the ARRA monies and then we are asking for 5 additional buses to be added to our hybrid fleet; again this is in keeping with reducing our carbon footprint and making sure we are being environmentally friendly in the deployment of services. Also, just to let the Board know it takes about 12 to 18 months from the time we order these buses for them to come in. We will try to see if we can get somewhere in between the production line to reduce the time, but that's about the average duration for a bus production.

MR. KICKLIGHTER: Motion to approve.

MR. ODELL: Second with a question. Are we purchasing in conjunction with another organization?

MR. ODIMGBE: Yes we are doing a piggy back with another organization because we do not have our own RFP on the street and that's going to take us at least another 90 days to go through that process.

CHAIRMAN LIAKAKIS: Is this grant money or where are we getting the money to purchase these?

MR. ODIMGBE: Yeah 80% of the money for this bus purchase is coming from federal grants with 20% local match coming from local SPLOST that the county approved. That the Commissioners did approve for us to use.

CHAIRMAN LIAKAKIS: How much is the 20%?

MR. ODIMGBE: The 20% just be approximately \$569,000.

CHAIRMAN LIAKAKIS: 569?

MR. ODIMGBE: Thousand yes.

CHAIRMAN LIAKAKIS: Okay, all in favor of purchasing the 5 hybrid buses raise your hand. Motion passes. Item five, request Board to approval to purchase 14 paratransit buses.

MR. KICKLIGHTER: Motion to approve.

MR. ODELL: Second with a question.

CHAIRMAN LIAKAKIS: Go ahead Pat—I mean Harris.

MR. ODELL: Are we currently leasing the buses now?

MR. ODIMGBE: We are leasing 10 buses. 10 paratransit buses are under lease yes that's correct.

MR. ODELL: And how much per bus, per month is it costing us to lease the buses?

MR. ODIMGBE: 1,500.

MR. ODELL: So we're spending \$15,000 a month?

MR. ODIMGBE: Correct.

MR. ODELL: For leasing buses?

MR. ODIMGBE: Correct.

MR. ODELL: And how long have we been spending \$15,000 per month for these buses?

MR. ODIMGBE: Since January.

MR. ODELL: And when will these buses be available?

MR. ODIMGBE: The ones that we are purchasing?

MR. ODELL: The 14. If we approve that today, when will people be riding those buses in Chatham County?

MR. ODIMGBE: We estimate that they should be available to us right about December of this year.

MR. ODELL: December of this year?

MR. ODIMGBE: Correct.

MR. ODELL: So we will continue the leasing until then?

MR. ODIMGBE: That's correct sir.

MR. ODELL: Do you know if there are any notice requirement as far as lease termination that we must give?

MR. ODIMGBE: Not with this particular lease. No we can terminate at anytime.

MR. ODELL: And just for the record, the leasing company that company's name is --

MR. ODIMGBE: Veolia.

MR. ODELL: Is that your company?

MR. ODIMGBE: That's correct sir.

MR. ODELL: And that item was approved by the Board?

MR. ODIMGBE: It was approved by the Board yes.

MR. ODELL: When it was on the agenda to be approved by the Board, it indicated on the agenda item that we were leasing those from Veola?

MR. ODIMGBE: That's correct.

MR. ODELL: Will you pull that and provide us with that at your earliest convenience.

MR. ODIMGBE: Will do that.

MR. ODELL: That's all I got thank you.

CHAIRMAN LIAKAKIS: Let me make a comment on that. The cost factor, January, February and March cost the CAT Transit Authority \$1,365,000. How much do these buses cost what is the individual cost on those buses?

MR. ODIMGBE: The cost of a Teleride bus about \$56,000.

CHAIRMAN LIAKAKIS: 56,000?

MR. OIMGBE: That's correct.

CHAIRMAN LIAKAKIS: So if we bought 10 of them for 56,000 that's \$560,000 correct?

MR. ODIMGBE: Yes. We are actually paying \$15,000 a month I believe for the buses.

CHAIRMAN LIAKAKIS: No, but I'm just using 10 at 56,000 that's \$560,000 and here it is for 3 months alone we spent \$1,365,000.

MR. ODIMGBE: No sir--

CHAIRMAN LIAKAKIS: Well if it's \$15,000--

MR. ODIMGBE: A month for all 10 buses.

CHAIRMAN LIAKAKIS: Oh, okay. Alright I was breaking it down in another area.

MR. ODIMGBE: Just to add to this dialogue when CAT took over Teleride services in January Chatham Area Transit had no buses to deliver the service because First Transit had 10 buses that it took out of circulation and Chatham Area Transit was in dire need for 10 buses and that—

MR. ODELL: My question wasn't directed towards the necessity why we had to do that. I understand why we had to do it and from a business standpoint I understand the business necessity there, but for our mutual understanding I'd like to have seen this a few months ago because I think the leasing is kinda like people that go to those rent to own furniture places when you can go buy a tv for \$400 they pay \$1,400 for the same tv. That irritates me because it hurts the people who could least be hurt and you know, I understand the situation with Veola. I understand it, we've approved it. I have no problems with this as long as the buses come in.

MR. ODIMGBE: And also if I may add, and I'm not trying by any means to defend anybody I'm just trying to present the information for the Board to be educated about this transaction. If we went out in the open market to lease buses it's gonna cost approximately \$2500 to \$3500 per month to lease each bus and that information I provided to Michael Kaigler who did ask for it. So from my perspective this lease with Veolia is a steal because we just got them at \$1500 and this information anybody can get this information just call the leasing companies and they will tell you how much they will charge you to lease these buses and not counting all the mileage.

MR. ODELL: Charles not to debate this, and I do have some follow up questions on Veoli and the turnover rate employee turnover rate which I'd like to see provided to us at some point, Veoli is not a not profit organization.

MR. ODIMGBE: That's correct.

MR. ODELL: And for us to publicly give the impression that this for profit organization is being benevolent in receiving \$15,000 a month really presses my intelligence. Veola is in the business to make money. This was a business agreement which we entered into, I understand that. What I do not understand or accept is this is a steal, Veolia have more information about transportation than a hundred commissioners setting like this. We are not the ones to ever be in a position to take advantage of Veoli so it's a deal. I have some concerns about it, but we're getting out of the deal but let's not say it like we're getting for a steal. They are not a benevolent organization they are for profit to make money off of this County organization that's the deal. Some of us may not know it, but I understand the deal.

CHAIRMAN LIAKAKIS: Charles repeat again the \$15,000 a month goes through what date now?

MR. ODIMGBE: The lease started in January.

CHAIRMAN LIAKAKIS: And it goes through when?

MR. ODELL: December.

MR. ODIMGBE: Ah yeah as soon as we get the new buses in we'll terminate the lease so it should be through December.

CHAIRMAN LIAKAKIS: So it's in the contract that if we get the buses before December that we eliminate the individual leasing of the buses.

MR. ODIMGBE: That's correct. If the buses come in next month, the Veolia buses will be out of here.

CHAIRMAN LIAKAKIS: Alright, now we need to vote on that. All in favor of the approval to purchase 14 paratransit buses raise your hand (pause) passes. Item six; request Board approval to award engineering contract to Post, Buckley, Schuh & Jernigan, Inc., Kern-Coleman & Company and Arrowood for facility needs analysis and conceptual design of CAT's corporate offices. You want to explain that Charles.

MR. ODIMGBE: Yes Mr. Chairman, we are asking the Board to approve the award of engineering contract to PBS&J, Kern-Coleman & Company and Arrowood for facility needs assessment and conceptual design for the CAT offices. As the Board is aware Chatham Area Transit offices is in great disrepair, it's been around for some time and it's literally falling apart we do have space issues within that particular facility. The bus yard needs to be redone, our bus wash needs to be redone and just a lot of work. We issued a request for qualification of all the firms that responded, two firms responded Maintenance Design Group and PBS&J. My staff reviewed the RFP's that came in and ranked based on the criteria that they developed and their conclusion was that PBS&J was the most - is the more qualified of the two firms to perform these services for us. Part of what we looked at was experience in doing facilities renovation projects which is a very complex thing to do and the firms ability to stay with us through the duration of the project; so not just to initiate the design, but to actually to available through construction and close out for the project. We've negotiated a cost of \$99,660 for the actual work. We are asking the Board to allow us a 14% contingency which is typical for construction and engineering projects and we're asking the Board to approve the award of this contract to PBS&J for an amount not to exceed \$113,612.

CHAIRMAN LIAKAKIS: Okay Charles lets do this again so everybody understands this because there was some misunderstanding on the leasing on the buses. I want you to start out now for Post, Buckley, Schuh and Jernigan tell us what they're gonna do and how much it's

gonna cost. Terry Coleman and Company what they're gonna do and the cost and Arrowood company how much it cost and what they're gonna do. Break it down in those three ways because I want all the members of the Board to understand that.

MR. ODIMGBE: Based on the staff report, it's gonna be very challenging for me to break it down for you because this is a fixed fee project.

MR. KICKLIGHTER: I motion that we table it until that information that's requested is provided.

CHAIRMAN LIAKAKIS: Do we have a second on that?

MR. FARRELL: Second.

CHAIRMAN LIAKAKIS: We have a second. Now Charles – when asked to table it we can't discuss it anymore. Yeah, so it's been requested to table it Charles until you bring the information because I want all of the members of the Board the CAT Board to fully understand what each company's gonna do, how much it costs and then bring it back to us – you don't have that information right now with you and I can understand that reasoning so what we're gonna do right now is table it until you can bring it back to us at the next meeting then. Because that's important for all of us to really understand our cost factor.

MR. ODELL: And can they also bring back whether or not federal statute or state statute applies as to the procurement process and what I mean is that the federal government is where we receive a fair amount of our money, is very wonderful in telling us how we can spend our money so they establish rules that apply to but occasionally don't apply to them and underpinning of my question is whether or not this is a best value contracting and knowing whether or not it's federally controlled or state controlled tells me which would apply because the feds can do a best value. The statute of Georgia statute wise procurement is a lowest bid. One dollar is a lowest bid; lowest competitive bid so other intangible things are not considered. Ty's representative is here and that will be part of the response when the Chairman's question is – thank you.

CHAIRMAN LIAKAKIS: Okay we have a motion on the floor and a second to table this until the information is brought back to our Board. All in favor raise your hand. Make a note –excuse me, all oppose, two. Motion carries.

MR. HOLLIDAY: Mr. Chairman, point of information. Was there an actual vote on request to Dump the Pump? I'm unfamiliar with the

process and I apologize for even asking the question but I didn't – that was item number two was there actually a vote on that?

CHAIRMAN LIAKAKIS: Yeah, we also vote on that.

MS. CLARK: Excuse me, you voted on the proclamation but you didn't vote on the request for the approval.

CHAIRMAN LIAKAKIS: Okay, let's go back then and on that particular item before we go on the -this request.

MR. KICKLIGHTER: (in audible)

CHAIRMAN LIAKAKIS: Okay request Board approval for the American Dump the Pump event. All in favor signify by raising your hands. Motion passes. Okay Dean. Okay we've already voted for tabling and we've got 2 people that abstain. Are you talking about this issue which issue you wanna speak about?

MR. HUME: I just have a question for clarification. During the discussion on the transfer station wasn't the –was the corporate offices for CAT originally designed to be housed in that? That's all I wanted to know. Because I'm unclear, I thought they were originally.

CHAIRMAN LIAKAKIS: Patrick.

MR. HUME: Oh I'm sorry. Brett Hume, tax payer.

MR. SHAY: The project that I think you're referring to is the Transit Center or the Transit Terminal not the transfer station, right? The one that's intended to go in downtown Savannah.

MR. HUME: Yes sir.

MR. SHAY: And it did at one time have corporate offices located in it, but over the years the amount of budget that was available to spend on those facilities has dwindled. So the corporate office component has not become part of that project for the downtown area. That answer your question?

MR. HUME: Very much.

MR. SHAY: Thank you.

CHAIRMAN LIAKAKIS: Okay, need a motion on the floor for executive session for personnel and real estate.

MR. ODELL: So moved.

MR. DAWSON: Second.

CHAIRMAN LIAKAKIS: Now this is added we need to add that on because it's really important that the Board members go into executive session for this.

MR. ODELL: We need a motion to add.

CHAIRMAN LIAKAKIS: Motion to add executive session for one.

MR. ODELL: So moved.

MR. DAWSON: Second.

CHAIRMAN LIAKAKIS: All in favor signify by raising your hand. Motion passes. Now we need a motion to go into executive session for personnel and real estate.

MR. ODELL: So moved.

MR. DAWSON: Second.

CHAIRMAN LIAKAKIS: Alright all in favor signify by raising your hand. Motion passes. Let's go back into the green room and as soon as we do this executive session we will reconvene as the Chatham County Commission.

Meeting adjourned at 12:17 p.m.

Respectfully Submitted by:

Patricia R. Clark, Secretary-Treasurer
Chatham Area Transit Authority