

CHATHAM AREA TRANSIT  
AUTHORITY

BOARD MEETING

OF

November 5, 2010

10:19 A.M.

CHAIRMAN LIAKAKIS: Good morning everyone. Glad to have you here for our Chatham Area Transit Authority meeting. I now call the meeting to order and ask for Patricia to have the roll call please.

MS. HAWKINS: Good morning. Chairman Liakakis

CHAIRMAN LIAKAKIS: Here

MS. HAWKINS: Dr. Thomas

DR. THOMAS: Here

MS. HAWKINS: Ms. Stone

MS. STONE: Present

MR. HAWKINS: Mr. Holmes

MS. STONE: He's here.

MS. HAWKINS: Mr. Shay

MR. SHAY: Here

MS. HAWKINS: Mr. Farrell

MR. FARRELL: Here

MS. HAWKINS: Mr. Odell

MR. ODELL: Here

MS. HAWKINS: Mr. Gellatly

MR. GELLATLY: Here

MS. HAWKINS: Mr. Kicklighter

CHAIRMAN LIAKAKIS: He's here

MS. HAWKINS: Mr. Dawson

MR. DAWSON: Here

MS. HAWKINS: And Mr. Broker called and said that he would not be able to make the meeting this morning.

Also present at the meeting was Ty Butler, Charles I. Odimgbe, and Patricia Hawkins.

CHAIRMAN LIAKAKIS: Okay alright all of the members of the Authority were distributed the minutes. We need a motion on the floor for the approval of the last meeting.

MS. STONE: So moved Mr. Chairman.

MR. DAWSON: Second.

CHAIRMAN LIAKAKIS: Have a motion on the floor and a second, all in favor signify by raising your hand. Motion passes. Under new business 1) request Board amend the fiscal 2011 annual budget for Chatham Area Transit to include projects in the Grant fund, Charles.

MR. ODIMGBE: Linda Cramer will be providing that report.

MS. CRAMER: Good morning. This is really just a clean up item. As you know the County finance staff is working with CAT on the financial administration for the Authority. And one of the items we did not have in the initial budget was the grant fund budget which list a lot of the capitol projects that CAT is interested in doing and funding sources and none of these projects will really start until the funding is there, but we did want to put the budget together for you. So that's what we have here and we just like you to approve that.

CHAIRMAN LIAKAKIS: Okay everybody has that distributed. We need a motion on the floor—

MR. ODELL: I motion to approve.

MR. DAWSON AND DR. THOMAS: Second.

CHAIRMAN LIAKAKIS: We have a motion on the floor and a second to approve that grant fund proposal. All in favor signify by raising your hand. Motion passes. Item 2: Request Board approval to incorporate the Authority's bank accounts and related treasury management needs into Chatham County's banking services contract with Wells Fargo Bank, North America. Linda.

MS. CRAMER: Again this is an administrative item. Since County finance is administering the CAT bank accounts now and CAT for years has operated under their own banking services contract which is set to expire pretty soon. So we had talked with Wells Fargo who is the County's bank and also has been the Authority's bank about just

bringing the Authority's banking operations under the County. What they will do is element the compensating balance requirement which CAT now has of \$175,000 which would be real good because cash flow is a little shaky with the Authority. And then we would pay service fees and they'd be – we're thinking they'd be about \$800 a month. We would be able to do the wire transfers from the County for CAT and other related administrative functions.

MR. ODELL: Move for approval.

MR. FERRELL: Second.

CHAIRMAN LIAKAKIS: We have a motion on the floor and a second for approval. All in favor signify by raising your hand. Motion passes. Another item for Finance Director, request Board authorize a resolution for the application and establishment of a line of credit in the amount of \$1.7 million with Wells Fargo Bank, North America.

MR. ODELL: Move for approval.

MR. KICKLIGHTER: Second.

CHAIRMAN LIAKAKIS: Have a motion on the floor and a second for approval of the \$1.7 million fund. All in favor signify by raising your hand. Motion passes.

MR. KICKLIGHTER: Mr. Chairman if I may just for the record state that I'm in here. I wasn't here with roll call so-

MR. ODELL: We listed you.

CHAIRMAN LIAKAKIS: You were recognized.

MR. KICKLIGHTER: Thank you.

CHAIRMAN LIAKAKIS: Request CAT Board's participation in the Centennial observance of the founding of the Girl Scouts. Charles.

MR. ODIMGBE: Yes Mr. Chairman this is a simple request. The Girl Scout would love for Chatham Area Transit to support their event in the celebration—their Centennial celebration by providing bus service for their Bridge Walk and also providing some transportation to the park after the walk. They did estimate about 5,000 individuals showing up for this particular event and I believe we are costing it at about \$1500 total in staff and revenue vehicle amount. So what we are asking the Board

today is to authorize this service as a donation to and participation in the Girls Scouts Centennial celebration.

MR. ODELL: Move for approval.

MS. STONE: Second

CHAIRMAN LIAKAKIS: We have a second. Any questions? All in favor signify by raising your hands. Motion passes. Item 5, request Board approve the request of Mr. Levi Ratliff to purchase a CAT bus bench.

MR. ODIMGBE: This is a very unique request and I thought we'd come to the Board and ask for their permission to do this. Mr. Ratliff according to him, proposed to his wife after his grand proposal plan didn't work out due to weather. So he proposed to his wife on this bench and ever since they've always come back to this bench to celebrate. So this year he called us wanting to know if he could purchase that bench as part of the anniversary celebration. I really thought this is a really feel good story to – we know about the bus stops just to show that something good does come from bus stops and bus benches. (Laughter) and this is one of them so we are asking the Board at this point to authorize us to sell this bench to Mr. Ratliff and wife for the amount of a dollar.

MR. SHAY: Approve.

CHAIRMAN LIAKAKIS: Dean.

MR. KICKLIGHTER: Mr. Chairman I think this is a nice gesture, but I don't know how appreciative his wife would be if he paid a dollar for his anniversary—(interrupted by laughter). Having said that, again, I really think this is a nice thing but I think the gentleman; it's not our kind gesture selling it for a dollar, it's every person that pays taxes out there selling it for a dollar. I actually was kind of curious just road by and looked at it, it's a nice wrought iron bench with nice wood seats. I think if the gentleman would pay for the replacement of the bench then he should get that bench, but you know, it's the taxpayers and they are being hit every way you turn around now and every store you go in they're being asked for donations and this is just a donation of taxpayers' money so I really, truly would like to see us have him pay to replace the bench and then, but that's just my thought.

CHAIRMAN LIAKAKIS: Why don't you put that in form of a motion.

MR. KICKLIGHTER: I put that in form of a motion.

MR. GELLATLY: Second.

CHAIRMAN LIAKAKIS: Okay, we have a motion on the floor and a second to notify Mr. Ratliff that the bench will be given to him as long as he pays for the replacement of the bench.

MR. ODELL: Can we at least give some depreciation for him on that?

MR. ODIMGBE: I was gonna ask that as clarification.

MR. KICKLIGHTER: How much a bench of that type cost?

MR. ODIMGBE: Those are what -- \$250. About 250.

MR. ODELL: 250?

MR. ODIMGBE: \$250 yeah.

MR. ODELL: And we've had that for what 10 years?

MR. ODIMGBE: A very long time. I don't know exactly how long. It's one of the older benches.

MR. KICKLIGHTER: But you can still sit on it at this point.

MR. ODIMGBE: Yes, yes you can. It's in very good shape. It's very good shape.

MR. GELLATLY: Do you have an older bench to replace it with?

MR. ODIMGBE: We do have a bench. Yes sir I spoke with my Director of Maintenance last night before this meeting last night yesterday evening about it. We do have a bench sitting in the Maintenance Department right now that we can replace it. The exact same bench.

MR. KICKLIGHTER: Not to be downer of things, but I still have people and does everybody else up here standing up at bus stops throughout the district so you know, I think the gentleman should pay. If its \$250 at least 200 to replace the thing. Because it's not as if we need to replace it.

MR. ODIMGBE: The clarification I'm seeking is am I allowed to depreciate it, I mean I can depreciate it up to today—

MR. KICKLIGHTER: I would amend my motion to state that the gentleman pay \$200 for that bench.

MR. GELLATLY: Second.

CHAIRMAN LIAKAKIS: Okay we have a motion on the floor and a second for the replacement of the bench for \$200 if Mr. Ratliff would pay for that then that particular bench will be passed on to his wife. All in favor signify by raising your hand. Oh excuse me. Helen.

MS. STONE: I just had a quick question. I mean to be fair about this if we're gonna charge the gentleman - what - I think there needs to be a formula for the depreciation. I mean I don't think just picking a random number if you're charge somebody for something is the fair way to go about it. I would rather Mr. Odimgbe that you give us what you think is a fair price for the bench not just pick a number out of the hat. I agree that this is the taxpayer's money but if its depreciated more that 50%, why are we charging him \$200?

MR. KICKLIGHTERS: Well I proposed to my wife at Garibaldi's and I don't expect them to give me the dining room table. I mean—

MS. STONE: I understand. I just want to make it a fair price. I agree with Commissioner Kicklighter I just - I don't understand how we arriving at the cost of \$200 that's all. I agree with you that it should be done, but I don't know how much it has depreciated and what the fair price of a bench of its age would be.

MR. ODIMGBE: Again the goal what I wanted to do was go back and apply the depreciation that we use for most capital equipment and see how much money, but that's contrary to the motion that's on the floor now.

MR. ODELL: Can we do this. We gonna a lot of time on, I mean we got a \$175 million overall County budget. I don't want to spend a lot of time on this. Not that it's not important to him, I'm certain that it is. I understand Dean's proposal. I don't have a problem with it one way or the other. I understand Helen, but what I'd like to do is just get on with it because this is in the scheme of things really a speck so.

MR. KICKLIGHTER: I agree. It's just sign to me if our government—

MR. ODELL: We need to charge him something. We can't just give it to him because we can't gratuitously give away taxpayer's property because something is cute. We can't do that. That's the concept Mr. Odimgbe, that's the principal. What Helen is saying is let's have a systematic way of making that determination. I'll go any way you want to go, this aint a big deal. I don't want to spend a lot of time on it.

CHAIRMAN LIAKAKIS: Dean.

MR. KICKLIGHTER: Call for the question.

MR. ODELL: Thank you.

CHAIRMAN LIAKAKIS: Alright we have a motion on the floor and the question has been called about paying –about having Mr. Ratliff pay \$200 for the bench and we’ve had the conversation from Commissioner Stone about doing a less cost that sounds more reasonable so the people that are voting for the \$200 raise your hand and then we’ll go for the other portion of it.

MR. KICKLIGHTER: What’d you say?

CHAIRMAN LIAKAKIS: People who want the \$200 to please raise your hand.

\*Not: Kicklighter and Gellatly were the only two in favor of the \$200 payment.

CHAIRMAN LIAKAKIS: Okay we need a motion on the floor quickly about make one Helen.

MS. STONE: I think I’ll make a motion that Mr. Odimgbe you figure a fair price based on the depreciation, bring it back to us and be done. Because this could set a precedent going forward and I just want to make sure that we have.

MR. HOLMES: So that’s a motion?

MS. STONE: Yes.

MR. HOLMES: Second.

CHAIRMAN LIAKAKIS: Okay, all in favor signify by raising your hand. Okay, motion passes. Alright let me explain to the audience. What we have on our Commission is we go up on the Board when we vote, but when we have more people on our particular Authority that’s the reason why we raise our hands so we get a count for all of the members of the Transit Authority. Next item; Executive Director’s report that is verbal. Charles.

MR. ODIMGBE: Thank you Mr. Chairman. Very quickly, our year-to-date ridership continues to look good. On the fixed route we did 4.5% when compared to last year and about 1.3% on the Paratransit when compared to last year. However, I want the Board to know that this increase in ridership has been causing some challenges. It is a good



thing that ridership is increasing, but you will be getting more and more complaints about late buses, late arrivals and late pick-ups and these are directly related to the ridership issue. We are still waiting to hear from FTA regarding their financial audit. The Triennial Audit is complete and has already been filed. We have done all the corrections on the Triennial but we haven't received anything from the FTA regarding the Finance Audit. Also, just want to let the Board know that we are gonna reverse course and begin to accept the terms of insurance both for the fixed paratransit and the marine services and this will most likely increase our insurance budget by approximately \$1000. I do believe it's the minimus for the safety that we buy by accepting this terrorism insurance. CAT's position all along has been not to accept it and I think Veolia has counseling me that we should reverse that and start accepting that liability—accepting that insurance. And finally, I just want to let the Board know I have two new senior level employees on my staff although one of them is not here and the reason is because when you look at him, he's back working on the maintenance issues and that's our Maintenance Director, Roy Covington and also we do have a new Finance Director in the name of Terri Harrison. Terri is in the audience, she's taking over from Beth Thulin to handle our finances. I do have all of the FYI. Because the Board meeting was moved up, we cannot collect all of the data until the end of the month and the timing for it just didn't give us enough time to have the data all completed prior to the docket meetings. So I do have all of the FYI's just in case because again, we have to get the information including the last day of the month. So I'm willing to distribute it if any Board members want to take a look at it.

CHAIRMAN LIAKAKIS: Any questions? Patrick.

MR. SHAY: Mr. Odimgbe I'm very concerned that we continue to make progress on our Center Station Transit Center project. Could you give us any update on the actions since the last time we had a CAT Board meeting.

MR. ODIMGBE: Yes sir, we've made some good progress on it and I can talk about from the engineering side. I know Pat Monahan is handling the property acquisition. What we've done so far we've re-scoped the project the engineers are just putting the concepts together and the goal is to come to the Board with the concepts. We're gonna give more than one concept for Board review and approval. So the engineers are currently working on the re-scoping, I've had about two meetings with them and as you are aware since John left we had to first of all reorganize having the lead of the engineers leaving us. With a new lead now, the role is just to reorganize based on the last approval that the Board did to allow them to re-scope and do the environmental work associated with the re-scoping.

MR. SHAY: I think its good that you're gonna bring alternatives, but you're the professional and Veolia is the world wide expert. I don't want to just turn this into a debate amongst all of us who are very interested as stewards but not engineers. I would expect that if you bring alternatives forward that you bring forward with one that is your recommended alternative.

MR. ODIMGBE: That's correct. It's not only gonna be the recommended alternative, it's gonna be the one that is constraint by how much funding we have available to do the project.

MR. SHAY: Well that would seem to make sense. Also last time we had a presentation on the Comprehensive Operations Analysis that's being undertaken and the presentation was that we were gonna see results from that some time in the spring and I made the very strong suggestion that at the very least the COA in regards to this particular facility would be advanced. And I read in the minutes there that there was some kind of nodding of heads and uh huh, but I want you to understand that the contract with Veolia includes the COA and we've delayed on the COA for a long time because we were in protracting negotiation just like the Transit Center is part of the contract with Veolia. And I'm putting you on the hot seat in the sense that you represent Veolia in the face of this County and I want to make sure that you report back at the next meeting as to the progress that we are making on both the Transit Center and the Comprehensive Operations Analysis and that we get an ongoing report at each of our meetings so that we can track that as a milestone.

MR. ODIMGBE: That is fine. We intend to do that anyhow. I think Raul is coming in next week to finalize the data and I made it clear to him that we're not gonna wait 'til spring to have the results especially as it relates to the Transit Terminal project. So he's very aware of it even though that's gonna skew the project. I just want this Board to know I might be the face of Veolia but I still - I'm still very concerned about the legacy that I leave so no matter what I will do the best that I could to make sure that the product that we deliver is nothing but the best. Because yes it might reflect on Veolia, but I do have a resume to defend and I will do my best to defend my resume. So from that perspective, yes I've been working with them to make sure that some of the visions you, this Board has laid out being attended to while we move forward is the COA and also we have just jump started the AVL project because we are six months into the contract now and the AVL project should be done within the first twelve months. So that project is just started. I received a timeline for it and will be providing that timeline to the Board. I have a call today just to make sure that they are fully on board with me

regarding the way I'd like to deploy the system and the timelines that are associated with it.

MR. SHAY: Could you explain the AVA project.

MR. ODIMGBE: I'm sorry it's the Automatic Vehicle Locator project that Veolia – that's part of what Delegated Management is to provide to the Chatham Area Transit Board and according to that same contract it becomes property of CAT the day it will be deployed. And I also, just to let you know that we are fully on board with your vision, is that we are – I met with Herb Norton and we are seeking more funding to get a more robust system. This current system is cell based. I'd rather have a system that is radio based. It's substantially more expensive but it will give us more functionality and actually it's more dynamic for different things moving forward because our environment changes all the time and we should be able to change with it.

MR. SHAY: We appreciate the work that you're doing but you do understand that we have very, very high expectations.

MR. ODIMGBE: I understand that and I'm really being attentive to those. On the KPI's the Key Performance Indexes all of the numbers are looking very good for us. Ridership, very good; ontime performance you can see we started going up and now we're tracking back down due to ridership. Complaints; complaints are gonna begin to go up. Again, it's because of late buses and late pick-ups and I had a meeting with Wayne and ACAT regarding this issue. We're doing the best that we can and actually we just placed an order for 8 buses to replace some our paratransit fleet and we will be buying more to complete the 14 that the Board approved for us to buy. We are piece (in audible) at this point because of funding issues. The road call between miles, I'm very happy with the numbers. It's gone from 3000 to now 6812, so that means that the maintenance is going really well. If you look at the preventive maintenance staff is now at a 100%, which means every vehicle in our fleet goes through a preventive maintenance when it's scheduled and when it's due. The farebox recovery is another area that gives me real joy. We had projected 18.9% on average we should be about 27 to 30% in terms of farebox recovery and that is really good numbers for us. The PM's – the preventive accidents are going down and that's good. And the passengers on Teleride are – they've been pretty stable between 1.3 and 1.5 so from a key performance perspective we are doing really well and it's beginning to reflect. However, it's not without its growing pains. We are gonna get these calls when the buses are late and we do explain it to them that as soon as we do the COA and we do the entire service they might see an improvement in the system and/or we may have to infuse

more money because whenever you start having ridership it becomes frequency issue so we need to look at that also. That's all I have sir.

CHAIRMAN LIAKAKIS: Charles it was mentioned by Commissioner Shay concerning these projects because some of the members of this Transit Authority are being pushed by people riders and others that are concerned about our Transit Center. It's been going on for a long period of time and other projects that CAT does, so whatever we need to do we need to move these things on at a faster pace. Because it cannot continue to go like this because number one, the situation about purchasing that site over there that transit has got to be completed in a short period time because we don't want to be placed in a situation where the economy goes up high again and the property becomes more valuable and so that place us in a situation about spending more money for the site and also any other projects that CAT has. And so as Commissioner Shay did say about we need to have reports on this so please give us these reports and whatever necessary that we can help out to get these projects on a move at a faster pace.

MR. ODIMGBE: Well noted.

CHAIRMAN LIAKAKIS: Okay.

MS. STONE: Mr. Chairman.

CHAIRMAN LIAKAKIS: Yes.

MS. STONE: Wayne.

CHAIRMAN LIAKAKIS: Wayne.

MR. DAWSON: I just want to make sure that we get a written report like the key performance indicators that you talked about. If we could always get a written report on that would be really helpful.

MR. ODIMGBE: On the projects you mean?

MR. DAWSON: Well on the last thing. All the key performance indicators that you went over.

MR. ODIMGBE: Okay.

MR. DAWSON: If we could get a written report on those.

MR. ODIMGBE: Yeah the reports are here right now.

MR. DAWSON: Oh is that part of the financial-

MR. ODIMGBE: Again, like I mentioned earlier, we couldn't submit it on time because the Board meeting was moved up and we didn't collect all the data prior to.

MR. DAWSON: Gotcha.

MR. ODIMGBE: So I have all of the reports. The backup reports.

MR. DAWSON: Okay.

DR. THOMAS: Mr. Chairman.

CHAIRMAN LIAKAKIS: Yes Priscilla.

DR. THOMAS: I'm very happy about the progress that you are making and (in audible, microphone was not on) Commissioner Shay and we've gone way, way back for a long time on this Transit thing and I'm hoping and praying that we'll have something that will be concrete between now and 2012 or before then.

MR. ODIMGBE: Before then.

DR. THOMAS: It's been a long, long ride, I mean we have been looking at, we've been changing and it's just been ongoing and hopefully now we can move in the direction where we can have something concrete because everytime I go to my neighborhood meetings and excreta my constituents are always asking me about the Transit Center. So, hopefully I will have something more to give them.

MR. ODIMGBE: It is my hope that at the December Board meeting you will have some options on the scope to vote on.


CHAIRMAN LIAKAKIS: Okay do you have anything else Charles?

MR. ODIMGBE: No sir that's all I have.

CHAIRMAN LIAKAKIS: That's it? Okay we now will adjourn the CAT meeting and reconvene as the County Commission.

Meeting adjourned at 10:45 a.m.

Respectfully Submitted by:

A handwritten signature in cursive script, appearing to read "Patricia Hawkins", written over a horizontal line.

Patricia R. Hawkins, Secretary-Treasurer  
Chatham Area Transit Authority